Human Trafficking: shedding light on a complex issue

Give Way to Freedom is a private operating foundation that creates and supports targeted, culturally relevant projects aimed at providing care and empowerment to survivors of Human Trafficking, as well as those vulnerable to trafficking.
Courtney Albert, LMHC

• Founder & President of Give Way to Freedom & Licensed Clinical Mental Health Counselor


• Intensive course in Somatic Trauma Therapy (2011-2012) & in Transforming Trauma with EMDR, 2017

• Member of the Dutchess County Taskforce Against Human Trafficking ‘s steering committee & chair of the training subcommittee

• Co-chair of the Coalition Against Sexual and Domestic Abuse (CASADA)

• Bachelor of Arts in Psychology, with honors, from the University of Rochester, Masters of Education in Counseling Psychology from Temple University, Masters of Arts in Industrial/Organizational Psychology from the University of New Haven
Overview

- Human Trafficking Defined
- Human Trafficking Facts and Statistics
- Red Flags and Indicators
- The Victim’s Experience
- Case Examples
- Complexity of Recovery
- Survivor Centered Support
- Dutchess County Response
True or False

If a victim consented prior to abuse or was paid, it can still be trafficking.

Trafficking requires state or international border crossing.

Trafficking victims must be kidnapped and/or restrained physically.

Trafficking victims must be foreign nationals.
International Definition

“The action of recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring, or receipt of persons by means of the threat or use of force, coercion, abduction, fraud, abuse of power or vulnerability, or giving payments or benefits to a person in control of the victim for the purposes of exploitation, which includes exploiting the prostitution of others, sexual exploitation, forced labor, slavery or similar practices, and the removal of organs. Consent of the victim is irrelevant where illicit means are established.”

United Nations, 2000
Intersectionality

- Community violence
- Substance Abuse
- Immigration issues
- Intimate partner violence
- Sexual assault
- Human trafficking

Child abuse
U.S. Federal Definition

- The recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services through the use of force, fraud or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery.

- Sex Trafficking defined as the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, obtaining, advertising, patronizing, or soliciting of a person for the purpose of a commercial sex act.

- Trafficking victims in the U.S. can be divided into three populations:
  - Minors (under age 18) involved in commercial sex
  - Those age 18 or over involved in commercial sex via force, fraud, or coercion
  - Children and adults forced to perform labor and/or services in conditions of involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery, via force, fraud, or coercion
### A-M-P model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACTION</th>
<th>MEANS</th>
<th>PURPOSE</th>
<th>Under 18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recruit</td>
<td>Force</td>
<td>Involuntary Servitude</td>
<td>Recruit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harbor</td>
<td>Fraud</td>
<td>Debt Bondage</td>
<td>Harbor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entice</td>
<td>Coercion</td>
<td>Peonage</td>
<td>Entice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport</td>
<td></td>
<td>Sex trade</td>
<td>Transport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Provide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obtain</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Obtain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintain</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Maintain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertise</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Advertise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solicit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Solicit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patronize</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Patronize</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(How did the person get into the situation?)

(How was the person kept in the situation?)

(For what purpose was the person brought in/kept in the situation?)

For the purpose of commercial sex
## Key = Means

### Force
- Physical assault
- Sexual assault & Rape
- Confinement
- Kidnapping
- Deprivation of basic needs – food, water, sleep
- Facilitated drug use

### Fraud*
- Withholding of wages
- Fraudulent employment contracts
- False Promises
  - *Love, marriage*
  - *Education*
  - *Employment*
  - *Living conditions*

### Coercion*
- Threats to self, loved ones, pets
- Threats of arrest, deportation
- Blackmail
- Debt bondage
- Withholding of legal documents
- Other psychological manipulation & control
  - *Isolation*
  - *Monitored activities*
  - *Creating dependence*

---

* Easier to conceal, often overlooked
New York Safe Harbour for Exploited Youth Act (2008)

Any person under 18 years of age who has been subject to sexual exploitation as a result of their loitering for the purpose of prostitution or their engagement in an offer to exchange sexual conduct in return for food, clothing, a place to stay, drugs, or a fee.

(N.Y.S.S. Title 8-A § 447A)
Sex trafficked youth - survival sex & 3rd parties

**Under 18**
- Recruit
- Harbor
- Entice
- Transport
- Provide
- Obtain
- Maintain
- Advertise
- Solicit
- Patronize

For the purpose of commercial sex

**Survival Sex:** Sex in exchange for basic needs: food, shelter, safety

**3rd Party Controlled:** 3rd party introduces or facilitates involvement, may or may not be violent
Child abuse, child trafficking, and CSEC:

Child Abuse
- Sexual Abuse
  - Physical Abuse
  - Neglect
  - Emotional Abuse

Child Trafficking
- Labor Trafficking of a minor

Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children
- Minor Sex Trafficking
  - Pornography
  - Stripping / Exotic Dancing
  - Sex Tourism
Labor Trafficking Venues

• Domestic Work
• Construction
• Manufacturing
• Agriculture, forestry, fishing
• Restaurants, Food Service
• Hospitality
• Hair/nail salons
Sex Trafficking Venues

- Online
- Street
- Massage parlors
- Truck stops
- Escort services
- Bars/Strip Clubs
- Pornography
- **Brothels**: residential, apartments, outdoor, hotel rooms
Important things to remember

• Males, Females, Adults, Children

• International and Domestic – Poughkeepsie cases highlight this

• No movement is necessary for trafficking to take place

• Trafficking ≠ Smuggling

- United States – 32%
- Central America/Mexico – 24%
- South America – 3%
- Caribbean – 4%
- Western Europe – 1%
- Eastern Europe – 1%
- East Asia – 18%
- Southeast Asia – 9%
- South Asia – 3%
- Africa – 3%
- Central Asia - 1%
- Other – 1%
The federal crackdown on a Queens sex trafficking ring targeted an alleged brothel in this house in Poughkeepsie, as well as sites in Yonkers and Newburgh. Prostitutes are often driven in from Queens to one of the brothels, where they may stay for a week and sleep with dozens of men in a single night.

International Sex Trafficking Ring
2013
City of Poughkeepsie man admits to charges related to sex trafficking

Jeremy Davis, 24, pleaded guilty to second-degree promoting prostitution and two counts of second-degree criminal sexual acts

• Admitted to promoting prostitution of someone who was less than 15 years old
Human Trafficking vs Human Smuggling

**Human Trafficking**
- Crime against a person
- Exploitation based
- No movement required
- Elements of coercion
- Seldom aware of the entire process even if originally 'consented'
- Ultimately, trafficked persons do not consent to the abuses, exploitation, and human rights violations to which they are subjected

**Human Smuggling**
- Crime against a border
- Transportation based
- Requires crossing border
- No coercion
- Generally aware of the conditions of their travel, voluntarily engage
- Upon arrival, the smuggled person is free or required to work temporarily to pay off their smuggler
International Labor Organization, 2017

METRICS
40 million people were victims of modern slavery. This includes:
- 25 million people in forced labour
- 15 million people in forced marriage

GENDER
Women and girls accounted for 71 per cent of modern slavery victims.

DEBT BONDAGE
Debt bondage affected half of all victims of forced labour imposed by private actors.

CHILDREN
One in four victims of modern slavery were children.
Modern Slavery

Forced Labour

State-imposed Forced Labour

Forced Labour Exploitation

Forced Marriage

Forced Sexual exploitation of adults & commercial sexual exploitation of children
Forced Labor Sub Categories

- Forced labour exploitation: 64%
- Forced sexual exploitation: 19%
- State Imposed: 17%
Male victims, of forced labor, were more likely to be in mining, manufacturing, construction and agriculture.

Female victims, of forced labor, were more likely to be in accommodation, food service and domestic work.
Victims by Industry
(129 total incidences, some victims represented multiple times due to retrafficking)

Labor Trafficking in the United States, Northeastern University, 2014
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Labor Violations and Labor Trafficking</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less Pay Then Promised</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Withheld Pay</td>
<td>81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under Minimum Wage</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denial of Pay</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illegal Deductions</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No written earnings statement</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe water, toilet</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hazardous Work Environment</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No meal breaks</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Movement to work controlled</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victim lived where worked</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depriving/Disorienting</td>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Threats or use of Violence</td>
<td>82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demoralizing</td>
<td>82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diminishing Resistance</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intimidation and Control</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deception of Consequences</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use/Threatened Use of law</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Urban Institute, Northeastern Univ., 2014
Most victims of forced labor exploitation suffered multiple forms of coercion at the recruitment and employment stages

- Withholding or threat of withholding of wages
- Threats of violence
- Acts of physical violence
- Threats against family
- Having to repay a debt
Forms of coercion may depend on gender

• Male victims were more likely to be subjected to: threats against family, withheld wages, confinement, denial of food and sleep and threats of legal action

• Female victims suffered higher rates of sexual violence and were more likely to have their passports or other documents withheld

International Labor Organization, 2017
Forced sexual exploitation of adults and commercial sexual exploitation of children

- 4,800,000 victims around the world
- 1,000,000 of the victims are under 18 years of age
- Women and girls account for more 99% of all victims of forced sexual exploitation
- Victims were exploited on average of about 2 years

International Labor Organization, 2017
Freedom Network 2017 Client Gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Number of Clients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>3011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>601</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trans Female</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trans Male</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other/Unknown</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>3725</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Freedom Network 2017  Age of Clients

The diagram shows the distribution of clients by age range in 2017. The majority of clients fall within the 25-40 age range, constituting 46% of the total. The 18-24 age range follows with 19%, while the 41-60 age range accounts for 24%. The 0-17 and 60+ age ranges are the smallest, with 10% and 1% respectively.
Freedom Network 2017 Type of Trafficking
Findings from Youth Involvement in the Sex Trade: A National Study 2016 - close to 1,000 youth interviewed in 6 cities throughout the US

**Gender**
- Cis Female: 41%
- Cis Male: 36%
- Trans Female: 5%
- Trans Male: 3%

**Age**
- 13 - 17: 21%
- 18 - 24: 79%
Findings from Youth Involvement in the Sex Trade: A National Study 2016

**Sexual Orientation**
- Heterosexual: 53%
- Bi Sexual: 9%
- Gay: 2%
- Other: 36%

**Race**
- Black/AA: 72%
- White: 13%
- Multi-Race: 8%
- Hispanic/Latino: 7%
- Other: 13%
Findings from Youth Involvement in the Sex Trade: A National Study 2016 - close to 1,000 youth interviewed in 6 cities throughout the US

- 77% of respondents indicated that their first experience trading sex took place while under the age of 18
- The average age of first trading sex was 15.8 years of age
- Almost 73% had left home under the age of 18
- 32% had their first sexual experience before age 13
  - 24% (30% of cis females) reported that their first sexual experience was nonconsensual
Findings from Youth Involvement in the Sex Trade: A National Study 2016

- **Self-Reported Service Needs**
  - Employment or education 49%
  - Housing or help paying for utilities 47%
  - Food or Money 36%
  - Counseling or advice 16%
  - Addiction or health services 11%

- **Prevalence of Pimps:** 15% of participants reported having pimps who exerted coercion, control or force. The cis females % was higher with 21%.
  - Pimps were both male & female

- **Market facilitators versus Pimps:** 19% of participants were coded as having market facilitators who were not pimps – mutual support, don’t share $, no rules, cross referrals, strategies to stay safe
WESTCHESTER COUNTY DATA (provided by DSS through Safe Harbour)  June 2013 to January 2017

300 Screened Child Victims

- 56 State Confirmed
- 180 Federally Confirmed
- 54 Unconfirmed
- 10 Pending
Child/Youth trafficking

• In the USA, children are most likely to be sexually exploited by their families or family friends for monetary gain – National Institute of Justice, 2007

• Young women and girls are recruited into the commercial sex industry due to economic need, family and peer encouragement, need for social acceptance and previous childhood trauma – Urban Institute reported on Dank et. al. 2014

• Reports estimate that as many as 50%-80% of child sex trafficking victims have had contact with the child welfare system

• In 2007 the New York Office of Children and Family Services identified 2,652 child trafficking victims statewide
  • 85% of them had contact with the child welfare system, primarily in the form of abuse and neglect proceedings.
  • 75% of the child trafficking victims in NYC had been in foster care at some point in their lives.
Gang Involved Sex Trafficking

- At least 110 gangs are involved in commercial exploitation.
- 85% of pimps/sex trafficking facilitators interviewed were gang involved.
- On average, sex trafficking facilitators control 4.5 victims.
- Female recruiters and sex trafficking facilitators are perceived to be a significant and growing feature of the underground sex economy.

(Carpenter, Gates, et al, 2016)
INDICATORS / RED FLAGS
Indicators/ Red Flags

Recruitment
- Misleading information was given by the recruiter/employer
- A person is in debt to their recruiter/employer

Personal Documents and Belongings
- A third party arranged travel and work documents
- Passport/documentation confiscated, false documentation
- No or few personal belongings
- Inappropriately dressed for the weather

Threat/Reality of Violence
- Signs of abuse (physical, sexual, drug)
- Signs of fear, anxiety, depression, suicidal ideation
- Inconsistent stories
- Gaps in their story
Indicators/Red Flags

Freedom of Movement / Living Conditions
- Physically confined, restricted or controlled communications and movement, cannot choose his/her own residence
- Third party insists on being present for conversations
- Person in rarely seen or lacks of knowledge of whereabouts

Working Conditions
- Performing tasks for which he or she was not originally recruited
- Excessive and/or irregular hours
- Exposed to risks that compromise health and safety
- Not paid, underpaid, or has wages taken from him/her
Indicators of domestic minor sex trafficking

- Tattoos, brands, signs of “ownership”
- Child runs away from home frequently and/or for significant periods of time
- Truancy from school
- Indications or reports of domestic violence/intimate partner violence
- Describes a stalking situation
- Older boyfriend/close companion
- New, unexplained possessions - clothing, phone, jewelry
- Excessive, almost pathological attachment to cell phone
- Disconnection from social supports
- Uses street slang for sex work – urban dictionary
- Age inappropriate sexual behavior and/or sexually transmitted infections
- Minor is working more than is in school
CASE EXAMPLES &
THE VICTIMS EXPERIENCE
Utica Ring

Lynette Tilden  Edward Tilden  Alexandria Davall  Michael Olsen

David Jamroz  Michael Curcio  Rosheen Brooks  Jakeem Penn  Curtis O'dell
Victims Experience

Backstory

Vulnerabilities
Risk-Factors
Poly-Victimization

Where and when does it all begin?

Victims Experience while trafficked

Force
Fraud
Coercion

Duration of experience
Types & level of violence
Types of coercion
Relationship to Perpetrator

Impact: Consequences

Complexity of recovery

Trauma symptoms
Coping Strategies
Disclosure
Stigma
Where & when does it begin? The Key is Vulnerability

- Individual
- Interpersonal
- Community
- Societal
The Backstories

“Like many ‘willing victims’ the process of breaking me down had begun long before I met my trafficker”

“I was hoping to make a connection with someone and to find a way out of my life. I was fourteen, and I was in desperate need of help. Unfortunately, nobody except Greg seemed to notice and offer help”

Walking Prey, Holly Austin Smith p. 85 & 86
Push Factors: Individual

- Poverty, lack of financial security
- History of child sexual abuse
- Early exposure to violence
- Family dysfunction (DV, mental illness, drugs, divorce)
- Runaway or throwaway episodes, homelessness
- Lack of education/difficulty in school
- History in foster care
- Desire for material comforts
- Disabilities
- Drug Addiction
Push Factors: Interpersonal

- Physical abuse of self or other/pet
- Sexual abuse of self or other
- Early exposure to violence in the home
- Obligation or desire to help family
- Peer influences/ Gang involvement
- Desire to please “boyfriends”
- Need to belong, desire for love, protection, acceptance
- GLBTQ in a family or community that rejects that identity
- Low self- esteem, higher incidences of abuse and homelessness
Push Factors: Community & Societal

Community
- Lack of educational and/or economic opportunities
- Large transient male populations
- Area with large and international airports
- Corruption
- Community Violence

Societal
- Glorification of pimp culture
- Wide spread use of internet & social media
- Political and civil unrest
- Gender inequalities
- Ethnic discrimination
- Natural disasters
Pull Factors

- Promises of economic opportunities
- Promises of material comforts
- Offering of love & affection
- Offering of basic needs: food, shelter.... for self and/or loved ones
- Offering Acceptance, protection
- The glamour and anonymity of city life
- Hope for a better future, success
Who Are The Human Traffickers?

- Neighbors, friends, relatives, community leaders (village chiefs, religious leaders), returnees, peers
- Company owners, managers, subcontractors
- Families
- Organized crime
- Diplomats & governments
- Pimps
- Gangs
- Market facilitators
Victim’s Experience in trafficking situations

Duration of experience?

Relationship to Perpetrator?

Violence, Intimidation, Coercion, Traumatic Experiences

Types and levels of intensity?

• Physical and/or sexual abuse
• Physical and/or sexual abuse of others or of pets
• Deprivation of basic needs
• Economic Control/Abuse
Psychological Coercion in Human Trafficking: Applying Biderman’s Framework (1957)

- **Isolation** increases power imbalance and dependence
- **Monopolization of perception** limit exposure to outside world
- **Induced debility and exhaustion** deprivation of basic human needs such as food, sleep, healthcare
- **Threats** threats of violence, threats of death, threats to family, threats of arrest or deportation

Baldwin et. al., Qualitative Health Research, 2014
Psychological Coercion in Human Trafficking: Applying Biderman’s Framework (1957)

- **Occasional indulgences** Countering abusive behavior with occasional kindness or compassion

- **Demonstrating omnipotence** Claiming powerful connections to law enforcement or deities

- **Degradation** Insults, humiliation, denial of privacy and dignity, including physical and sexual humiliation and assault

- **Enforcing trivial demands** Instills a need for conformity and perfection

Baldwin et. al., Qualitative Health Research, 2014
Sex Trafficking

- **COERCION and THREATS**
  - Threatens to do physical harm
  - Threatens to harm family
  - Threatens to shame victim to community
  - Threatens to report to police/immigration

- **ECONOMIC ABUSE**
  - Creates debt bondage that can never be repaid
  - Takes some or all money earned
  - Forbids victim to have access to their finances or bank account
  - Forbids victim to go to school

- **EMOTIONAL ABUSE**
  - Humiliates in front of others
  - Calls names
  - Plays mind games
  - Makes victim feel guilt, blame for the situation
  - Creates dependence
  - Lies about police involvement in the trafficking situation

- **USING PRIVILEGE**
  - Treats victim like a servant
  - Defines gender roles to make subservient
  - Uses nationality to suggest superiority
  - Uses certain victims to control other victims
  - Hides or destroys important papers

- **SEXUAL ABUSE**
  - Forcibly victim to have sex with multiple people in a day
  - Uses rape as a weapon and means of control
  - Treats victim as an object used for monetary gain
  - Normalizes sexual violence and selling sex

- **MINIMIZING, DENYING & BLAMING**
  - Makes light of abuse or situation
  - Denies that anything illegal is occurring
  - Places blame on victim for the trafficking situation

- **POWER & CONTROL**

- **ISOLATION**
  - Keeps confined
  - Accompanies to public places
  - Creates distrust of police/others
  - Moves victims to multiple locations
  - Rotates victims
  - Doesn’t allow victim to learn English
  - Denies access to children, family and friends

Labor Trafficking
“Torture is intended to invade a person’s presumption of privacy, intimacy, and inviolability and thereby destroy their belief in their own independence”

Unpredictability

Uncontrollability

Little ability to predict or manage events that effect health and safety

Trafficking In Human Beings amounts to Torture and other Forms of Ill Treatment”  HBF & OSCE 2013, p. 49
# Health & Safety

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risks</th>
<th>Potential Consequences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Physical Abuse, deprivation</td>
<td>Physical health problems: cuts, burns, broken bones, headaches, fatigue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Threats, Intimidation, Abuse</td>
<td>Mental Health Problems: depression, anxiety, disassociation, fearfulness nightmares, flashbacks, hostility/anger, PTSD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual Abuse</td>
<td>STDs, pelvic inflammatory disease, infertility, unwanted pregnancy, forced abortion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Substance Misuse (D&amp;A)</td>
<td>Overdose, D&amp;A addiction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CASE EXAMPLES
El Monte, CA Sweatshop

- 72 victims, 10 perpetrators

- **Recruited**: sew for nation’s top retailers, given false passports

- **Worked**: 18-20 hour days, less than $2.00/hr. Some for 17 years

- **Housed**: apartments, razor wire fences, barricade doors/windows, and full-time guards

- **Isolated**: Mail was censored, communication was monitored

- **Threats** against victims and families

- Charges: involuntary servitude, conspiracy, harboring & transporting aliens, kidnapping

- Outcome: 4-7 years in prison, $4-5 million in assets seized and out of court settlement
US v. Afolabi: hair braiding (NJ)

- **Targeted**: impoverished African villages, 10 y/o and up
- **Deceived**: believe in better life, receive education
- **Worked**: hair braiding salons, up to 14 hours/day, 6-7 days
- **Forced**: to turn over all earnings, including their tips
- **Confiscated**: passports or identification;
- **Isolated**: unable to speak with their families outside of the defendants’ presence; make any outside friends.
Girls age 12-19

- promises of modeling / glamorous lifestyle
- 12 hour days strip clubs/dancing + street
- repeated assaults for “rule breaking”
Ashland, Ohio (labor trafficking)

- Ashland, Ohio
- Cognitively disabled woman and her child recruited to live with perpetrators
- Intentional physical injury for pain meds
- Forced manual labor via threats
- Controlled movement: video, time
Newburgh Man, Alexander Adams, charged with Sex Trafficking

- Operation ran in New Windsor and Newburgh between April 2009 - March 2013
- Recruited at least 10 women
- Often homeless, hungry, heroin addicts
- Isolated women in motel rooms and threatened them with physical violence & in some instances used a whip
- Catalogued and marketed the women on the internet
US v. Shackleford

- Undocumented minor placed in her care
- Agreed: to provide accommodations, food, clothing, visits with family
- Instead:
  - forced to clean home/trailer park, work on cars, sell beer & food to local residents, demanded his pay
  - inadequate food, denied visits with family, withheld birth certificate
  - struck by Shackleford
  - threats to report to law enforcement
- Convicted: forced labor

Shackleford was convicted and sentenced.

JUDGMENT as to Lucinda Lyons Shackleford (1), Count(s) 1, 2 yrs. prob.; $100.00 sp. asst; $724.00 rest.; Count(s) 2, 2 yrs. prob. to run concurrent; $25.00 sp. asst. Restitution Ordered. Signed by District Judge Max O. Cogburn, Jr on 11/13/2012. (chh)
Case Example Discussion

- What factors made the victim’s vulnerable?
- What means did the traffickers use to induce the victims to work?
- If you encountered one of these victims over the course of this situation, what factors might have suggested she/he was being trafficked?
- Why do you think the victims did not leave right away?
THE IMPACT

Challenges of identification & complexity of recovery
Complexity of coping strategies, disclosure and life/social stressors
U.S. Citizen Victims

- May face stigma and prejudice from society
- People who exploited them may be very close by/related/trusted individuals in their life
- May have no immediate access to identity documents and proof of residency
- May have underdeveloped life skills
- May suffer from trauma and/or drug addiction
- May have criminal arrest records
- Are often underage
Undocumented Victims

- May not have identity documents
- In a strange country
- Isolated
- May be unable to communicate
- Various cultural issues
- Fear of law enforcement officers
- Often do not see themselves as victims
Coping Mechanisms that make it difficult to identify and assist victims

- Most victims do not self identify
- Shame / Self Blame
- Bonding to trafficker
- Normalization of exploitation / minimizing experiences
- Social withdrawal
- Substance abuse
- Avoidance of trauma triggers (people, places, topics)
- Dissociation
- Suicidal Ideation
- Risk-taking behaviors
- Self Harm
- Agitation, Outbursts
- Deflection / defense mechanisms
Human trafficking victims often suffer from:

- Post Traumatic Stress Disorder
- Mood Disorders
- Generalized anxiety disorder
- Panic Attacks
- Major Depressive disorder
- Dissociative disorders
- Co-morbid substance related disorders

Alexander et.al., APA, 2005; Family Violence Prevention Fund, 2005;
Zimmerman et al 2006; International Organization for Migration, 2006; Zimmerman, 2003
## Mental Health Symptoms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mental Health Symptoms</th>
<th>No   ( %)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Depression</td>
<td>112 (54.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety</td>
<td>98 (48.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTSD</td>
<td>157 (77.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depression + anxiety + PTSD</td>
<td>91 (56.9)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CSEC youth reported higher rates of **avoidance & hyperarousal** as well as higher incidences of:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>Sexual Abuse/Assault</th>
<th>Commercial Sexual Exploitation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Problems skipping school</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>60.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developmental inappropriate sexualized behaviors</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>62.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol Use</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Substance Abuse</td>
<td>26.1%</td>
<td>68.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal Activity</td>
<td>17.5%</td>
<td>54.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Running away from home</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>71.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Trauma of Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Youth: Comparison of CSE Victims to Sexual Abuse Victims in a Clinical Sample. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence, 2016*
Additional challenges to identifying & assisting

- Distrust of law enforcement and/or service providers
  - *Immigration concerns*
- Lack of awareness of resources
- Debt-Bondage
- Frequent movement of victims
- Victims may be trained to tell lies
- The victim may be the one in trouble for that which they are being coerced, tricked or forced to do
- Fear of retaliation (threats to self or loved ones)
- A belief that no one can help them – hopelessness & resignation
Complexity: Disclosure

Trafficking victims often have to tell their stories to get help. However, traumatic accounts are often confused and inconsistent.

1. The memory of the event can be recalled accurately but there is a barrier to disclosure

2. There is a genuine failure to recall a traumatic event

Herlihy, J, Turner, S. Should discrepant accounts given by asylum seekers be taken as proof of deceit? Torture, 2006; 16,2.
1. Barriers to disclosure

The Interview Itself: learning the truth takes time

- Attitude of interviewer
- Location of interview, proximity of the trafficker to the victim
- Types of questions asked
- Insensitivity to gender and culture
- Use of terminology

Cognitive & Emotional Difficulties

- Avoidance & Mistrust
- Dissociation
- Shame – there are experiences that sometimes cannot be shared

Herlihy, J, Turner, S. Should discrepant accounts given by asylum seekers be taken as proof of deceit? Torture, 2006
2. Genuine Failure in Recall

Traumatic memories

• Are not subject to simple conscious control
• Often can not be searched for and produced like a regular autobiographical memory. Are not evoked at will
• Are provoked by triggers/reminders of the event
• Are fragments, usually sensory impressions
  • Images, sensations, smells, emotional states
  • Do not have a “time-stamp” – often experienced as current experiences
  • No complete verbal narrative of the experience

Herlihy, J, Turner, S. Should discrepant accounts given by asylum seekers be taken as proof of deceit? Torture, 2006
Complexity: Life Stress & Social Support

Survivors symptoms are compounded by additional life stress, lack of social support, & cultural factors

- Rejection by loved ones
- **Stigma in the community**
- Threats from trafficker
- **Drug dependency**
- Lack of employment
- **Pending immigration claim**
- Rejection of immigration claim
- Culture
WORKING WITH SURVIVORS

Being Trauma Informed/Survivor Centered
Don’t ask what is wrong with the person, ask what happened to them.

Being Trauma Informed
The relationship should be collaborative

At every step emphasis on choice – when safe to do so

Survivors need to know that there is someone who cares and will listen carefully

Let survivors have predictability and control over their healing

Respect, inform, connect
Appropriate Boundaries

- A clear understanding of the limits and responsibilities of your role
- Model healthy communication and relationships
- Avoid the “rescuer” role
- Stay focused on one’s responsibilities to the client & the provision of helpful and appropriate services
- If working in conjunction with other services providers: maintain a healthy, open, communicating and functioning team
- Maintaining one’s physical and emotional safety
- Be friendly, not friends
- Avoiding burn-out (“compassion fatigue”)
Survivor Support

Immediate
- Safety
- Medical
- Bed
- Other

Short Term
- Housing
- Mental health
- Legal

Long Term
- Education, training, employment
- Options!
CHOICE

- When to leave
- Where to live
- Report to police
- Engage in services
- Receive mental health counseling

ACCESS

- Specialized, trauma-informed case management
- Current resources
- Public benefits
- Immigration relief
- Criminal justice advocacy
- Education & job training/readiness

✓ Reduced risk of re-exploitation
✓ Increased participation in the community and work force
✓ Decrease traumatization
✓ Better quality of life

This product was supported by grant number 2016-VT-BX-K050 awarded by the Office for Victims of Crime, Office of Justice Programs, U.S. Department of Justice. The opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this product are those of the contributors and do not necessarily represent the official position or policies of the U.S. Department of Justice.

FNTI, 2017
Dutchess County Response


1. Client displays indicators of human trafficking

2. Speak with the client alone, if possible, and utilize an interpreter if needed

3. Using a trauma informed approach, assess for safety concerns and screen for trafficking

4. If a potential victim is in danger and/or needs immediate medical help, contact 911

5. If you suspect human trafficking and/or would like to seek help for a potential victim, contact Family Services 24 Hour Crime Victims Hotline: 845-452-7272

6. If a potential victim is under the age of 18 (or suspected to be under 18) 24-Hour Child Abuse Hotline: 1-800-342-3720 Mandated line 1-800-635-1522 Contact Dutchess County’s Human Trafficking Coordinator: 845-249-4878

7. If a potential victim needs emergency mental health services, contact the Department of Behavioral and Community Health Helpline 845-485-9700 or Stabilization Center & Mobile Crisis

8. If a potential victim(s) would like help from Law Enforcement, contact Dutchess County Sheriff: 845-486-3800

9. Complete the Dutchess County Human Trafficking Tracking Form